Report No. FAA-RD-73-146

mJ

PROGRAMS RELATING TO AIRCRAFT CABIN MATERIALS FIRE

C. SIMPSON



September 1973

STATUS REPORT

Document is available to the public through the National Technical Information Service, Springfield, Virginia 22151

DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
FEDERAL AVIATION ADMINISTRATION
Systems Research & Development Service
Washington D.C., 20590

TECHNICAL REPORT STANDARD TITLE PAGE

		T 2 'F			
1. Report No.	?. Government Accession No.] 3. K	ecipient's Catalog N	io.	
FAA-RD-73-146					
4. Title and Subtitle		5. R	eport Date		
Interrelationship of FAA-DOT-NASA Programs Relatin		; 5	September 1973		
to Aircraft Cabin Material	s Fire		6. Performing Organization Code		
		ł			
7. Author(s)		8. P	erforming Organizatio	on Report No.	
Colin G. Simpson					
9. Performing Organization Name and Address		10	Work Unit No.		
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION			WORK UNIT ING.		
Federal Aviation Administration			Contract or Grant No		
Systems Research & Development Service					
Washington, D.C. 20590		13.	Type of Report and P	eriod Covered	
12. Sponsoring Agency Name and Address			Status Report		
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION		5			
Federal Aviation Admin		14	14. Sponsoring Agency Code		
Systems Research & Development Service Washington, D.C. 20590		17.	ARD=520	ode	
15. Supplementary Notes			AND=720		
to. Supplementary Noves					
				•	
16. Abstract			,		
At the confirmation of the confirmation		c c1			
Aircraft cabin materials toxic gas emission and fl					
pertinent to these hazard					
The relationships among th					
estimates for FY 1974.					
				•	
17. Key Words	18. Distribution St.	stement			
•			. 21 . 41 41	h1#0	
Aircraft Materials Tox Crash Fire Hazards	Document is available to the public				
Pyrolysis		through the National Technical Information Service, Springfield,			
Smoke		Virginia 22151			
	V 1 2 5 4 1 1 4 4		_		
19. Security Classif. (of this report)	20. Security Classif. (of this page)		21. No. of Pages	22. Price	
Unclassified	Unclassified		20		

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction	1
Hazards of Cabin Fires	2
Materials Flammability	3
Burning Materials Smoke Emission	4
Burning Materials Toxic Gas Emission	5
Flash Fire	7
Cabin Fire Control and Extinguishment	8
Total Cabin Environment Protection	9
Funding Estimates	10
References and Bibliography	. 11

INTRODUCTION

Post crash fires in transport aircraft are a major cause of fatalities in the air carrier segment of civil aviation. This report surveys the various hazards presented by such fires including the fire itself, smoke emission and toxic gas emission and their effect on cabin emergency evacuation.

The FAA and more recently the NASA both have E&D programs directed towards greater safety in the post crash fire environment. These efforts are presented to illuminate their complementary nature.

Future courses of action are outlined together with their probable impact on reducing cabin fire fatalities.

HAZARDS OF CABIN FIRES

A recent survey of transport accidents over the 1952-1972 period shows that there were at least 182 accidents where post crash fire occurred. ¹⁵ In 60 of these, impact alone caused the 1953 fatalities. In the remaining 122, the 1015 fatalities are largely attributable to fire.

In a post crash situation the spilled fuel ignites with the flames entering the cabin by melting the aluminum skin, through breaks in the fuselage structure or through opened doors. These flames then ignite the cabin interior materials. The initial hazards are the fuel flames and the burning material flames. Mobile occupants will of course attempt to move away from these flames toward the exits.

Being fed by the external fuel fire, the burning cabin materials emit both smoke and toxic gases. The smoke presents two hazards; one, of reducing interior visibility making it difficult to see the exits and two, producing lachrymal effects and respiratory smoke poisoning.

Toxic gases are emitted in a wide variety including carbon monoxide, sulfur dioxide, hydrogen sulfide, hydrogen cyanide, hydrogen chloride, hydrogen fluoride and other hydrocarbons. These gases produce varied toxic effects with some causing incapacitation and death when inhaled in minute concentrations.

A later hazard that occurs sometimes is the phenomenon of flash fire. Although little explored to date, flash fires apparently occur when the mixture of gases and smoke filling the cabin are ignited and burn very rapidly thoughout the cabin. Temperatures quickly reach over 1500°F which can be considered non-survivable. Flash fires have occurred in full scale fire tests and are suspected to have occurred in aircraft.

These hazards of material fire, smoke, toxic gases and flash fire vary in severity along the cabin length and vary in the time interval after crash at which they become incapacitating and then lethal. The fatalities they cause relate to how effectively the passengers and crew can exit the aircraft. In the recent Varig B-707 crash in Paris, these hazards occurred in flight with no exit possible. Fortunately this type of inflight fire is rare. That this particular B-707 was a cargo aircraft recently retrofitted with cabin seats and materials emphasized the urgency to upgrade the regulations covering cabin fires.

References in this report grouped under a combined Reference and Bibliography listing beginning on Page 11. Asterisks denote references in report.

MATERIALS FLAMMABILITY

The initial approach to reducing the effects of cabin fire was to limit the flammability of cabin materials. Standards were established in 1947 limiting the horizontal burn rate of materials. Tests run at the National Aviation Facilities Experimental Center (NAFEC) in 1962 showed that many materials in use passed this standard but yet could cause fatal fires. ¹ In 1967 these standards were made more stringent for some materials used in cabins and required these to be self extinguishing after the flame is removed. In 1972 these standards were applied to all cabin materials. These recent standards apply to newly certificated aircraft with the 1967 standards applying to older transports whenever they are refurbished by the airlines.

Further regulatory action planned by the Flight Standards Service, FAA, on cabin material flammability standards includes all older transports to meet these standards at some future date. The existing standards are considered adequate to control the rate at which cabin fires spread so that they can be extinguished by prompt action. Although self extinguishing in the small sample tests when the flame is removed, currently used materials can be burned when exposed to crash fuel fire or other fire sources.

The NASA has research underway for the development of more fire resistant cabin interior and cabin insulation materials. In the past, such improved materials seldom met the airlines criteria of wear, maintenance, cost and weight to the extent that these materials would be adopted voluntarily by the manufacturers and the airlines. Such a state-of-the-art improvement would warrent consideration of increasingly stringent agency standards.

The National Highway Transportation Safety Administration has adopted vehicle cabin material flammability standards that are equivalent to the FAA's 1947 standards. These are felt to be adequate for ground vehicles. 51

The United States Coast Guard has a modest annual program underway to specify non-flammable materials for floor coverings, etc., to prevent fire both from a personnel hazard standpoint and for protection of ship structural integrity. 57

BURNING MATERIALS TOXIC GAS EMISSION

The aviation community became more aware recently that toxic gas emissions from burning cabin interior materials constituted a hazard in transport crashes. Such awareness arose from the recent inclusion of tests for these toxic substances in autopsies of transport crash victims and their subsequent detection in significant quantities. This occurred during the accidents of Anchorage in 1970, New Haven in 1971 and Chicago O'Hare and Midway in 1972.

The first directed agency effort towards toxic gas analysis was the study by the National Bureau of Standards in 1968 8 in which both smoke and toxic gas emissions were measured for 141 samples of cabin materials. Massive industry full scale tests also were run in 1968 53 in which toxic gas concentrations were measured. A primary interest of these industry tests, however, was to evaluate both fire control and suppression techniques and smoke hoods, etc., for passenger protection. Little emphasis was placed on the reduction of toxic gas emissions by means of improved materials. The results of these agency and industry tests were insufficient to provide a basis for toxic gas regulatory standards.

A high priority project is in process at NAFEC to measure the toxic gas emissions from 60 currently used cabin materials. These data will enable issuance of a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking setting standards that eliminate the worst toxic gas producers. Full scale tests then will be conducted to measure toxic gas concentrations and distributions throughout the cabin and to relate these to the toxicological limits being developed by the Office of Aviation Medicine. These full scale tests then will be correlated to NBS Smoke Chamber gas emissions.

Recently both the NASA Johnson Space Center at Houston and Ames Research Center at Mountain View have been conducting material studies and full scale tests with the objective of developing improved cabin materials which possess flammability, smoke and toxic gas emission characteristics that should minimize the fire hazard potential in aircraft and spacecraft cabins. This work has been reasonably successful in terms of flammability but far from complete in terms of smoke, toxicity and practical use considerations. These new classes of polymers promise improvement, but much research remains to be done to bring them to the point of in-service use.

A new industry effort is underway by the Society of the Plastics Industry to study plastic material toxic gas emission. They are funding the National Bureau of Standards and the Southwest Research Institute to conduct tests which will be coordinated with the agency's work at NAFEC.

FLASH FIRE

Not much is known yet about flash fires but they occur apparently when the combined mixture of smoke, gases and oxygen in the burning cabin environment reaches a temperature at which they ignite and burn throughout the entire cabin. Temperatures reach 1500° in less than a second and ignite the entire cabin. All the oxygen in the cabin is consumed. Survival in a flash fire is not considered possible.

Clearly, the flash fire phenomenon is related to material flammability and material smoke and gas emissions. The nature of this relationship is yet to be determined. The agency funded a laboratory study recently by the National Bureau of Standards to study flash fires specifically in relation to burning polyurethane foam cushions, a major smoke and gas emitter. ¹⁶ These tests indicated that smoke particles were essential to produce a flashover. Further work is planned at NBS on the physics of flash fires as part of a NAFEC project for FY 1973 and FY 1974 to investigate the relationship of flash fires to the flammability, smoke and toxic gas standards.

No NASA work is currently underway specifically related to aircraft flash fires.

CABIN FIRE CONTROL AND EXTINGUISHMENT

The only new effort underway in this area is at NAFEC. The project on establishing the feasibility and effectiveness of an extinguishing agent distribution system throughout the cabin is scheduled for completion of testing against internal cabin fires by December 1974. Testing for effectivity against external fuel fires and preparation of a final report are due for completion by October 1975.

The project to examine the feasibility of cabin compartmentation as a means of isolating flash fires has been delayed by lack of funding and personnel until FY 1975. Completion of this work and provisions of data for rulemaking is scheduled for September 1975.

TOTAL CABIN ENVIRONMENT PROTECTION

The existing agency standards on material flammability, the proposed standards on smoke emission and the future standards on toxic gas emission all are intended to contribute to a more survivable cabin environment that would permit safe egress. The agency proceeded to develop these standards in this order as a matter of relative priority and because funding did not permit simultaneous projects. A high priority effort has been assigned to NAFEC to develop a plan and carry-out full scale fire testing to determine which of these hazards is most critical to passenger safety and to determine the interaction among the hazards. This is a complex task because flame, smoke and toxic gases are unevenly distributed throughout the cabin, but ideally no one of them should be the dominant hazard.

When this information is known, the small scale NBS Chamber standards can be upgraded to match a full scale environment where all hazards are of equal but minimum severity. Cabin protection can then be increased to permit a longer egress period. This work will make an invaluable contribution to aviation safety.

The agency's effort described above is now being and will continue to be fully coordinated with the NASA efforts and industry efforts so that the respective goals of these groups can be met with maximum efficiency.

To summarize, the DOT goal and especially the FAA goal, is to perform E&D work on the various hazards associated with cabin fire to provide data that will support the issuance of airworthiness standards. Aircraft designed and constructed to these standards should provide a survivable environment during cabin fires. The NASA goal is to conduct basic research on improved cabin materials technology so that industry can develop and apply these materials to aircraft designs. Cooperation between the FAA and NASA personnel results in mutual use of all data generated to assist each agency to attain its goal.

FUNDING ESTIMATES

	FY 1974
	\$000
Department of Transportation	
Federal Aviation Administration	
Systems Research & Development Service	260
Office of Aviation Medicine	44
United States Coast Guard	30
National Aeronautics & Space Administration	250

REFERENCES AND BIBLIOGRAPHY

FEDERAL AVIATION ADMINISTRATION

REPORTS

- * 1. Marcy, John F.; Nichols, E B; and DEMAREE, J. E.

 Flammability and Smoke Characteristics of

 Aircraft Interior Materials

 ADS-3, January 1964
- * 2. Marcy, John F. A Study of Air Transport
 Passenger Cabin Fires and Materials Technical Report
 ADS-44, December 1965
 - 3. Gassman, Julius J. Characteristics of Fire in Large Cargo Aircraft Technical Report ADS-73, March 1966
- * 4. Gross, D.; Loftus, J. J.; Lee, T. G.; and Gray V. E.

 Smoke and Gasses Produced by Burning Aircraft

 Interior Materials National Bureau of Standards

 Report NA-68-36, June 1968
 - 5. Marcy, John F. and Johnson, Richard Flaming and Self Extinguishing Characteristics of Aircraft Cabin Interior Materials
 Report NA-68-30, July 1968
 - 6. Gassman, Julius <u>Characteristics of Fire in Large</u> Cargo Aircraft (Phase II) Report FAA-RD-70-42, September 1970
 - 7. Marcy, John F., <u>Air Transport Cabin Mockup Fire Experiments</u>
 Report FAA-RD-70-81, December 1970
- * 8. Higgins, E. Arnold; Fiorica, Vincent; Thomas, A. A.;
 Davis, Harvey V. The Acute Toxicity of Brief
 Exposures to HF, HCI, NO2 and HCN Singly and in
 Combination With CO Report FAA-AM-71-41, November 1971
 - 9. Sarkos, Constantine P. <u>Small Scale Fire Tests of</u>
 <u>High Temperature Cabin Pressure Sealant and Insulating</u>
 <u>Materials Report FAA-RD-71-67, November 1971</u>

^{*} References in report

- 10. Darmer, Kenneth I. Short Term Animal Exposure to Carbon Monoxide and Hydrogen Cyanide Singly and in Combination Report FAA-AM-73-15, December 1972
- 11. Carbon Monoxide and Cyanide Hazards in Air
 Transport Accidents Accompanied by Fire
 Office of Aviation Medicine, January 29 1973
- 12. Jones, Jack and Sarkos, Constantine P.

 <u>Design Calculations for a Halon 1301 Distribution</u>

 <u>Tube for an Aircraft Cabin Fire Extinguishing System</u>

 Report FAA-RD-73-32, April 1973
- 13. Compartment Interior Materials Gas Emission
 Draft Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking
 14 CFR Part 25
- 14. Smoke Emission from Compartment Interior Materials
 In Transport Category Airplanes
 14 CFR Part 25, Docket No. 9611
- * 15. Miller, J. Melvin <u>Crash Fire-Fuel Survey</u> <u>Involving Turbine Powered Airplanes</u> Report No. AFS-140-73-3, June 1973
- * 16. Paabo, Maya; Comeford, J. J. A Study of the Decomposition Products of Polyurethane Foam Related to Aircraft Cabin Flash Fires Report No. RD-73-46, July 1973
 - 17. Einhorn, I. N. Phisio-Chemical Study of Smoke
 Emission by Aircraft Interior Materials, Part I
 Physiological and Toxicological Aspects of
 Smoke During Fire Exposure University of Utah
 Report No. RD-73-50, 1, July 1973
 - 18. Einhorn, I. N. Physio-Chemical Study of Smoke Emission by Aircraft Interior Materials, Part II Rigid and Flexible Urethane Foams University of Utah Report No. RD-73-50, 11, July 1973
- * 19. Lopez, Edward L. Study of Smoke Emission from Burning
 Cabin Materials and the Effect on Visibility in Wide
 Body Jet Transports Lockheed Aircraft Corp.
 Draft Report No. RD-73-127

DATA REPORTS - NAFEC

- 20. No. 15 Flammability Characteristics of Boeing Aircraft Interior Materials March 1966
- 21. No. 16 Flame Resistance of Airline Stewardess Uniform Clothing March 1966
- 22. No. 39 Combustible Characteristics of Cabin Interior Materials June 1967
- 23. No. 43 Flammability of Selected Interior Materials in FAA's Jet Star and Gulf Stream Airplanes March 1968
- 24. No. 47 Supplementary Radiant Panel Test Data January 1969
- 25. No. 51 Flash-Point and Thermal Degradation of Selected Interior Materials January 1969
- 26. No. 69 Evaluation of Fluorel Coating for Aircraft Interior Materials - May 1970
- 27. No. 70 Evaluation of AVCO/NASA Rigid Foam as a Fire Barrier for Cabin Protection - April 1970
- 28. No. 71 Evaluation of Fluorel Coating for Aircraft Fire Barrier Application - April 1970
- 29. No. 76 Analysis of Industry Furnished Smoke Emission Data on New Cabin Interior Materials - October 1970 Revised January 1971
- 30. No. 79 Summary of Class A Materials Fire Extinguishing Tests Using Liquid Nitrogen in a Closed, Non-Ventilated and Insulated Trailer - July 1970
- 31. No. 80 Some Effects from Cabin Pressure Sealants and Insulations on a Non-Melting Fuselage Environment During a Post-Crash Fire January 1971
- 32. No. 81 Description of Special Laboratory Fire Test Equipment February 1971

- 33. No. 82 Investigation of the Flammability Characteristics of Interior Materials from an FAA, DC3 Aircraft February 1971
- 34. No. 83 Effects of the Insecticide Dichlorvos Spray on the Flammability of Aircraft Interior Materials March 1971
- 35. No. 85 Flammability and Smoke Generation Studies of Air Force Litter Pads and Pillows April 1971
- 36. No. 86 Flammability and Smoke Tests of FAA Aircraft Interior Materials June 1971
- 37. No. 89 Flammability, Smoke, and Toxic Gas Test of AVCO Glass Reinforced Armor Panels January 1972
- 38. No. 90 Flammability, Smoke, and Toxic Gas Tests of a Glass Fiber Carpet February 1972
- 39. No. 91 Air Transport Cabin Mockup Smoke Studies February 1972
- 40. No. 93 Evaluation of Fire Test Coating on Urethane Seat Foam in Aircraft May 1972
- 41. No. 96 Flammability of Airline Stewardess Uniform Fabrics August 1972
- 42. No. 97 Tables of Materials Tested at NAFEC for Use as Transport-Type Aircraft Interiors - July 1972
- 43. No. 98 Smoke Emission by Burning Aircraft Wiring December 1972

NATIONAL AERONAUTICS AND SPACE ADMINISTRATION

- 44. Non-metallic Material Design Guidelines and Test Data Handbook NASA-MSC-02681 May 29 1970
- 45. Einhorn, I. N.; Seader, J. D.; Mihlfeith, C. M.;
 Drake, W. O. Flammability and Toxicological Characteristics
 of Isocyanurate Foams, Intumescent Coatings and Fluorel
 University of Utah NASA NA52-6063, March 1971
- * 46. Kourtides, D. A. and Parker, T. A. <u>Chemical Research</u>
 <u>Projects Office: Functions, Accomplishments and Programs</u>
 NASA TM X-62,186, September 1972
 - 47. Kuvshinoff, Boris W.; McLeod, Stephen B.; Katz, Richard G.

 <u>Directory of Workers in the Fire Field</u>

 NACA CR-121149, February 1973
 - 48. Heine, Donald A. and Brennaman, James J.

 The Cleveland Aircraft Fire Tests

 July 24 and 25, 1968
 - 49. Pinkel, I. and Preston, G. M. <u>Mechanism of Start and Development of Aircraft Crash Fires</u> NASA Report 1133, 1954
 - 50. Pacidrek, K. L.; Fratzer, R. H.; Kaufman, J.

 Fundamental Ignition Study for Material Fire Safety

 Improvement Dynamic Science Corp.

 NASA CR 114402, May 1972

NATIONAL HIGHWAY TRANSPORTATION SAFETY ADMINISTRATION

* 51. Flammability of Interior Materials in Passenger Cars, Multipurpose Passenger Vehicles, Trucks and Busses 49 CFR 571, December 1970

AEROSPACE INDUSTRIES ASSOCIATION

- 52. <u>Technical Summary Crashworthiness Development Program</u> Report AlA CDP-5
- * 53. Fire Suppression and Smoke and Fume Protection Crashworthiness Development Program
 Report AlA CDP-2, July 1965
 - 54. <u>Lighting and Exit Awareness Crashworthiness</u>

 <u>Development Program</u>

 Report AlA CDP-3, July 1968
 - 55. Evacuation Crashworthiness Development Program Report AlA CDP-4
 - 56. Recommended Regulation Changes Crashworthiness
 Development Program Report AlA CDP-RC, July 1968

UNITED STATES COAST GUARD

- 57. Materials Deck Coverings for Merchant Vessels, Structural
 Insulations, Bulkhead Panels and Interior Finishes for
 Merchant Vessels
 46 CFR 164 Shipping
 - 58. Report of Test on Comparative Non-combustibility Tests on Five Mineral Wool Insulation Materials for U.S. Coast Guard Report No. FR3843 National Bureau of Standards, Washington, D. C. May 1973
 - 59. Report of Test on Reheating Test of Mineral Wool and Glass Fibre Insulation Materials for U.S. Coast Guard Report No. TG10210-2193: FR3730 National Bureau of Standards Washington, D. C. May 1970
 - 60. Non-combustibility of Mineral Wool and Glass Fiber Insulation
 Materials
 Report No. 9988 National Bureau of Standards, Washington, D.C.
 February 1969
 - 61. Report of the Ad-Hoc Working Group on Fire Test Procedures
 Inter-Governmental Maritime Consultative Organization
 December 1969